

DIFFERENCES IN MEDICINE

AN INTRODUCTION TO MEDICAL ANTHROPOLOGY

“Medicine is a social science, and politics is nothing more than medicine in larger scale.” (Rudolf Virchow, 1829-1902, German physician and statesman)

ANT 206
Spring 2012, Thursday, 5-7th Periods
Instructor: Gergely Mohacsi
Email: mohacska@me.com
Office Hours: Thursdays (by appt.)
Home Page:



1. Course description

Anthropology is the study of humankind from both physical and cultural perspectives. And what is more physical and cultural at the same time than disease (and health)? This course introduces students to systems of healing and the multiplicity of medical practices and social suffering to understand similarities and differences in the ways of coping with disease across cultures, and how these dimensions change over time. From ancient Chinese and Greek views of the pulse to late-modern techniques of genetic engineering in the United States, from the scientific and public debates on the health effects of radioactivity and brain death in Japan to the diverse experiences of old age in India, we will consider a wide range of issues in the context of medicine and healing.

The course will start with lectures that provide an overview of some of the main concepts of medical anthropology by looking at the diversity of medical knowledge through history and cultural traditions. From the fourth class on, we will look at specific topics of disease and health through the different stages of the life cycle from conception to ageing and death with particular focus on some contemporary issues in global health and biomedicine to get acquainted with current trends in medical anthropology and beyond. Within this broad rubric, we will explore specific conditions through local lenses in order to gain insights into the ethnographic research of medicine and its methodologies.

We will discuss a series of books and articles every week in class and students will prepare group projects—based on participant observation in medical settings—on either chosen or assigned topics, such as hospice, infertility, flu epidemics, etc.

2. Requirements & Grading

A) Class participation (30%). First and foremost, an engaged and thoughtful participation in class discussion is central, so students should come to class having read and understood the assigned class readings when required.

B) Midterm presentation & synopsis (30%). Students will engage in group projects such as short-term participant observation in a medical institution or interviewing people about their health practices, etc. Each project will be discussed in class by offering a prospectus of the research and a critical evaluation of the literature based on an analytical synopsis (1-3 pages) of one group reading submitted by each participant at the assigned class of the group (see class calendar). ➔ **DUE: see class calendar for each topic**

C) Final paper and presentation (40%). The final results of each project will be presented in the class conference at the end of the term and written up as a group research paper (15-20 pages, co-authored by members of each group), which summarizes the ethnographic material and its principle arguments on the basis of the literature covered in class. ➔ **DUE: end of term (day of the class conference)**

Further important points to keep in mind:

- 1 **Language.** The language of the course is English, as well as most of the readings. Groupwork, however, may be conducted in Japanese.
- 2 **Plagiarism.** Plagiarism of any sort, including the use of online content, is not allowed. If you are not sure about what is or is not considered plagiarism, consult the instructor.
- 3 **Completion of final paper.** Final papers must be either personally handed to the instructor or delivered to the Drop Off Box (H-113) on or before the due date (day of the class conference).
- 4 **Class notes and audio-visual materials.** Instruction in this class is augmented with a variety of complementary materials, such as video excerpts, slideshows or direct quotes from primary sources. Students are responsible for taking notes on these materials and incorporating them into their papers.
- 5 **Class conference.** There is no final examination for this course, but there is a class conference during the examination period, which everyone taking this course is required to attend.

3. Course Learning Goals

At the end of this course, students should have:

- 1) developed a sophisticated understanding of the differences and similarities between various medical traditions and practices.
- 2) developed a solid understanding of the complex relations of culture and biology.
- 3) developed a basic understanding of the cultural-symbolic dimensions and techno-social situations of embodiment.
- 4) developed an understanding of the human experience of disease and its technological mediation.
- 5) improved their ability to form new ideas and to discuss compelling question.
- 6) improved their ability to critically read research literature and present persuasive and reflective analyses.
- 7) improved their abilities to conduct independent research and compellingly present it in a written form.

4. Class Calendar

(1) Class readings (☒) are assigned for in-class discussion. All students are expected to be familiar with them (reading, summary, questions) by the day of the class for which they are assigned.

(2) Group readings are assigned for presentations prepared by each group and summarized in an analytical synopsis by each member of the group (see above).

APRIL 12 ORIENTATIONS: DIFFERENCES IN MEDICINE (#1)

INTRO: Topics in medical anthropology

COURSEWORK: *About the class*

DISCUSSION: Should we all be (medical) anthropologists?

APRIL 19 EMBODIED HISTORIES: TRANSFORMING MEDICAL KNOWLEDGES (#2)

INTRO: Cultural anatomies

GUEST: Lecture by Prof. Shaun K. Malarney, followed by discussion

GROUPS: *Setting up research groups (5)*

☒ Class readings:

PHỤNG VŨ TRỌNG 2011 [1937] *Lũc Xi : Prostitution and Venereal Disease in Colonial Hanoi*.

Introduction. Vũ Trọng Phụng and the Anxieties of “Progress” (by SHAUN K. MALARNEY)

Chapter 5. Strolling inside the Dispensary

Chapter 8. Medical Examination Day.

APRIL 26 ETHNOMEDICINE: HEALING AND MAGIC (#3)

INTRO: Medical pluralism

FILM: *Doctors of Two Worlds* (by Natascha Solomon, 1989)

DISCUSSION: Healers and healing

GROUPS: *plan, topics, questions*

☒ Class readings:

BRIGITTE JORDAN 1989 *Cosmopolitical obstetrics: some insights from the training of traditional midwives*

MAY 10 REPRODUCTION: THE MEDICALIZATION OF BIRTH (#4)

INTRO: Medicalization

DISCUSSION: The politics of reproduction (Inuit birth)

GROUP 1: *New reproductive technologies and cultural change*

☒ Class reading:

PATRICIA KAUFERT and JOHN O'NEIL 2007 [1990] *Cooptation and Control: The Reconstruction of Inuit Birth*

Group readings:

RAYNA RAPP 1993 *Accounting for Amniocentesis*

MARCIA C. INHORN 2006 *Making Muslim babies: IVF and gamete donation in Sunni versus Shi'a Islam*

MAY 17 CHRONIC DISEASE: INEQUALITIES OF HEALTH (#5)

INTRO: Critical medical anthropology

DISCUSSION: Economies of chronic disease (AIDS in China)

GROUP 2: *Food, health and social inequalities*

✂Class reading:

SHAO JING 2006 Fluid Labor and Blood Money: The Economy of HIV/AIDS in Rural Central China

Group readings:

WILLIAM JANKOWIAK and DAN BRADBURD 2006. Using Drug Foods to Capture and Enhance Labor Performance: a Cross-Cultural Perspective

REBECCA J. LESTER 2009. Brokering authenticity: Borderline personality disorder and the ethics of care in an American eating disorder clinic

ANNEMARIE MOL, HANS HARBERS, and ALICE STOLLMEYER 2002. Food Matters: Arguments for an Ethnography of Daily Care

MAY 24 EPIDEMICS: RISK AND CULTURE (#6)

INTRO: Risk and culture

DISCUSSION: Emerging infectious diseases (Euro-American scientists and New Guinean highlanders)

GROUP 3: *Influenza and public health: dealing with uncertainty*

✂Class reading:

WARWICK ANDERSON. 2000 The Possession of Kuru: Medical Science and Biocolonial Exchange

Group readings:

ANN D. HERRING and STACEY LOCERBIE 2009 Global Panic, Local Repercussions: Economic and Nutritional Effects of Bird Flu in Vietnam

CELIA LOWE 2010 Viral Clouds: Becoming H5N1 in Indonesia

MAY 31 DRUGS FOR LIFE: HEALING THINGS (#7)

INTRO: Medical things

DISCUSSION: Herbs, pills, vaccines (material medica in West African contexts)

GROUP 4: *Pharmaceuticals and the problem of comparison*

✂Class reading:

SUSAN R. WHYTE, SJAAK VAN DER GEEST and ANITA HARDON 2002 *Social Lives of Medicines*
Chapter 3. Villagers and local remedies: the symbolic nature of medicines, pp.37-49.
Chapter 6. Drug vendors and their market: the commodification of health, pp.79-90.

Group readings:

VINCANNE ADAMS et al. 2005 The challenge of cross-cultural clinical trials research: case report from the Tibetan Autonomous Region, People's Republic of China

CORI HAYDEN 2007 A generic solution? Pharmaceuticals and the politics of the similar in Mexico

JUNE 7 OLD AGE: ANTHROPOLOGIES OF TIME (#8)

INTRO: Anthropologies of time

DISCUSSION: Technologies of dying (CPR, euthanasia and brain death)

GROUP 5: *"New ageing:" emerging forms of growing old*

✂Class reading:

HARRY M. COLLINS and TREVOR J. PINCH 2005. *Defying Death: Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation (CPR)*

Group readings:

LAWRENCE COHEN 1995 *Toward an Anthropology of Senility - Anger, Weakness, and Alzheimers in Banaras, India*

NAMINO GLANTZ 2010 *Using Formative Research to Explore and Address Elder Health and Care in Chiapas, Mexico*

JUNE 14 BIOSOCIETY: GENETICS, CARE, DISEASE (#9)

INTRO: From biopower to biosociality

FILM: *What's in your gene?* (BBC 2008)

DISCUSSION: Genetics, genomics, epigenetics

JUNE 21? CLASS CONFERENCE

final paper due

4. Readings

Reference Books

It is recommended that you consider purchasing at least one of the REFERENCE BOOKS listed below. They will be useful in framing issues for class discussion and also in writing up your final paper. Two of them are available in the library. Alternatively, books may be ordered from the university bookstore or purchased individually.

池田 光穂・奥野 克巳 (編) 2007 『医療人類学のレッスン: 病いをめぐる文化を探る』 東京:学陽書房。(▶ LESSON)

HAHN, ROBERT A. and MARCIA CLAIRE INHORN 2009. *Anthropology and Public Health : Bridging Differences in Culture and Society*. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press. (▶ HAHN & INHORN)

LOCK, MARGARET M. and VINH-KIM NGUYEN 2010. *An Anthropology of Biomedicine*. Chichester, West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell.

WHITAKER, ELIZABETH DIXON ed. 2006. *Health And Healing In Comparative Perspective*. Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Pearson Prentice Hall. (▶ WHITAKER)

※Class Readings

Class #2

MALARNEY, SHAUN KINGSLEY 2011 Introduction: Vũ Trọng Phụng and the Anxieties of “Progress”. In *Lũc Xi : Prostitution and Venereal Disease in Colonial Hanoi. T.P. Vũ, ed. Southeast Asia: politics, meaning, and memory.*, pp.1-44. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press.

VŨ TRỌNG, PHỤNG 2011. *Lũc Xi : Prostitution and Venereal Disease in Colonial Hanoi*. S.K. Malarney, transl. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
Chapter 5. Strolling inside the Dispensary
Chapter 8. Medical Examination Day

Class #3

JORDAN, BRIGITTE 1989. Cosmopolitical obstetrics: some insights from the training of traditional midwives. *Social Science & Medicine* 28(9):925-937; discussion 937-944.

Class #4

KAUFERT, PATRICIA A. and JOHN. D. O'NEIL 2007 [1990]. Cooptation and Control - the Reconstruction of Inuit Birth. In *Beyond the Body Proper : Reading the Anthropology of Material Life*. Body, Commodity, Text. Margaret M. Lock and Judith Farquhar eds. 359-375. Durham, [N.C.] ; London: Duke University Press (Reprinted from *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 4(4):427-442).

Class #5

JING, SHAO 2006. Fluid Labor and Blood Money: The Economy of HIV/AIDS in Rural Central China. *Cultural Anthropology* 21(4):535-569.

Class #6

ANDERSON, WARWICK. 2000. The Possession of Kuru: Medical Science and Biocolonial Exchange. *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 42(4):713-744.

Class #7

WHYTE, SUSAN R., SJAAK VAN DER GEEST and ANITA HARDON 2002 *Social Lives of Medicines*
Chapter 3. Villagers and local remedies: the symbolic nature of medicines, pp.37-49.
Chapter 6. Drug vendors and their market: the commodification of health, pp.79-90.

Class #8

COLLINS, HARRY M. and TREVOR J. PINCH 2005. Defying Death: Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation (CPR). In *Dr. Golem: How to Think about Medicine.*, pp.132-153. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Group Readings

Group 1:

INHORN, MARCIA C. 2006. Making Muslim babies: IVF and gamete donation in Sunni versus Shi'a Islam. *Culture Medicine and Psychiatry* 30(4):427-450.

RAPP, RAYNA 1993. Accounting for Amniocentesis. In *Knowledge, Power, and Practice: The Anthropology of Medicine and Everyday Life*. Shirley Lindenbaum and Margaret Margaret Lock eds., 55-76. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Group 2:

JANKOWIAK, WILLIAM, AND DAN BRADBURD 2006. Using Drug Foods to Capture and Enhance Labor Performance: a Cross-Cultural Perspective. In *Health and Healing in Comparative Perspective*. E. D. Whitaker, ed. Pp. 475-479. Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Pearson Prentice Hall.

LESTER, REBECCA J. 2009. Brokering authenticity: Borderline personality disorder and the ethics of care in an American eating disorder clinic. *Current Anthropology* 50(3):281-302.

MOL, ANNEMARIE, HANS HARBERS, and ALICE STOLLMEYER 2002. Food Matters: Arguments for an Ethnography of Daily Care. *Theory Culture Society* 19(5-6):207-226.

Group 3:

HERRING, D. ANN AND STACEY LOCERBIE 2009. Global Panic, Local Repercussions: Economic and Nutritional Effects of Bird Flu in Vietnam. In *Hahn & Inhorn*: 566-587.

LOWE, CELIA 2010. Viral Clouds: Becoming H5N1 in Indonesia. *Cultural Anthropology* 25(4): 625-649.

Group 4:

ADAMS, VINCANNE, S. Miller, S. Craig, A. Samen, Nyima, Sonam, Droyoung, Lhakpen, and M. Varner 2005. The challenge of cross-cultural clinical trials research: case report from the Tibetan Autonomous Region, People's Republic of China. *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 19(3): 267-289.

HAYDEN, CORI 2007. A generic solution? Pharmaceuticals and the politics of the similar in Mexico. *Current Anthropology* 48(4): 475-495.

Group 5:

COHEN, LAWRENCE 1995 Toward an Anthropology of Senility - Anger, Weakness, and Alzheimers in Banaras, India. *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 9(3):314-334.

GLANTZ, NAMINO 2009. Using Formative Research to Explore and Address Elder Health and Care in Chiapas, Mexico. In *Anthropology and public health bridging differences in culture and society*. In *Hahn & Inhorn*: 2266-298.

Further readings

1. ADLER, SHELLEY R. 2006 [1995]. Refugee Stress and Folk Belief: Hmong Sudden Deaths. In *Whitaker*: 331-340. (Reprinted from *Social Science & Medicine* 40(12): 1623-1629)
2. BIEHL, JOÃO 2007. A Life : Between Psychiatric Drugs and Social Abandonment. In *Subjectivity : Ethnographic Investigations*. Ethnographic studies in subjectivity 7. João Guilherme Biehl, Byron Good, and Arthur Kleinman eds., 397-422. Berkeley: University of California Press.
3. BARSH, RUSSEL 2006 [1997]. The Epistemology of Traditional Healing Systems. In *Whitaker*: 60-73. (Reprinted from *Human Organization* 56(1): 28-37)
4. BODDY, JANICE 2007 [1998]. Remembering Amal: On Birth and the British in Northern Sudan. In *Beyond the Body Proper: Reading the Anthropology of Material Life*. Body, Commodity, Text. Margaret M. Lock and Judith Farquhar eds., 28-57. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1998)
5. BOWRING, INN 2006 [2004]. Therapeutic and Reproductive Cloning: a Critique. In *Whitaker*: 568-581. (Reprinted from *Social Science & Medicine* 58(2): 401-409)
6. BROWN, MICHAEL F. 2006 [1988]. Shamanism and Its Discontents. In *Whitaker*: 95-108. (Reprinted from *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 2(2): 102-120.)
7. COHEN, LAWRENCE 1992. No Aging in India - the Uses of Gerontology. *Culture Medicine and Psychiatry* 16(2): 123-161.
8. COLLINS, HARRY M. and TREVOR J. PINCH 2005. The AIDS Activists. In *Dr. Golem: How to Think about Medicine.*, pp.153-179. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

9. COLLINS, HARRY M. and TREVOR J. PINCH 2005. Tonsils: Diagnosing and Dealing with Uncertainty. In *Dr. Golem: How to Think about Medicine.*, pp.61-83. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
10. CSORDAS, THOMAS J. 1989. The Sore That Does Not Heal - Cause and Concept in the Navajo Experience of Cancer. *Journal of Anthropological Research* 45(4): 457-485. (Reprinted in *Body/Meaning/Healing*. Contemporary anthropology of religion. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 2002., pp.194-219.)
11. DAVENPORT, BEVERLY ANN 2006 [2000]. Witnessing and the Medical Gaze: How Medical Students Learn to See at a Free Clinic for the Homeless. In *Whitaker*: 119-132. (Reprinted from *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 14(3): 310-327.)
12. FASSIN, DIDIER 2008. The Humanitarian Politics of Testimony: Subjectification through Trauma in the Israeli Palestinian Conflict. *Cultural Anthropology* 23(3): 531-558.
13. GOODMAN, ALAN H. 2006 [2000]. Why Genes Don't Count (for Racial Differences in Health). In *Whitaker*: 161-166. (Reprinted from *American Journal of Public Health* 90(11): 1699-1702)
14. KURIYAMA SHIGEHISA 1992. Between Mind and Eye: Japanese Anatomy in the Eighteenth Century. In *Paths to Asian Medical Knowledge*. Charles M. Leslie and Allan Young eds., 21-43. Berkeley: University of California Press.
15. LAKOFF, ANDREW 2002. The mousetrap: managing the placebo effect in antidepressant trials. *Molecular Interventions* 2(2):72-76.
16. LAQUEUR, THOMAS 1986. Orgasm, Generation, and the Politics of Reproductive Biology. *Representations* 14: 1-41.
17. LÉVI-STRAUSS, CLAUDE 1998 [1963]. The Sorcerer and His Magic. In *Understanding and Applying Medical Anthropology*. Peter J. Brown ed., 129-137. Mountain View, Calif.: Mayfield Pub. Co. (Reprinted from *Structural Anthropology*, pp. 167-185. New York: Basic Books).
18. LOCK, MARGARET 2006 [1998]. Menopause: Lessons from Anthropology. In *Whitaker*: 13-28. (Reprinted from *Psychosomatic Medicine* 60(4):410-419)
19. LINDENBAUM, SHIRLEY 2001. Kuru, Prions, and Human Affairs: Thinking About Epidemics. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 30:363-385.
20. MAGNÚSSON, FINNUR 1996. Activated Ageing. In *Bodytime: On the Interaction of Body, Identity, and Society*. Susanne Lundin, Lynn Åkesson, and Alan Crozier eds., 141-156. Lund: Lund University Press.
21. MARTIN, EMILY 1988. Medical Metaphors of Women's Bodies: Menstruation and Menopause. *Int J Health Serv* 18(2):237-254.
22. MILLER, BARBARA D. 2006 [2001]. Female-Selective Abortion in Asia: Patterns, Policies, and Debates. In *Whitaker*: 511-528. (Reprinted from *American Anthropologist* 103(4): 1083-1095)
23. NICTER, MARK, MIMI NICTER, SIWI PADMAWTI, C.U. THRESIA, AND PROJECT QUIT TOBACCO INTERNATIONAL GROUP 2009. Anthropological Contributions to the Development of Culturally Appropriate Tobacco Cessation Programs: A Global Health Priority. In *Hahn & Inhorn*: 298-331.
24. ONG, AIHWA 2007 [1988]. The Production of Possession - Spirits and the Multinational-Corporation in Malaysia. In *Beyond the Body Proper: Reading the Anthropology of Material Life*. Body, Commodity, Text. Margaret M. Lock and Judith Farquhar eds., 512-530 (Reprinted from *American Ethnologist* 15(1): 28-42).
25. PUGH, JUDY F. 2006 [2003]. Concepts of Arthritis in India's Medical Traditions: Ayurvedic and Unani Perspectives. In *Whitaker*: 41-52. (Reprinted from *Social Science & Medicine* 56(2): 415-424)
26. PETRYNA, ADRIANA 2005. Ethical variability: Drug development and globalizing clinical trials. *American Ethnologist* 32(2): 183-197.
27. SCHEPER-HUGHES, NANCY 2006 [2003]. Keeping an Eye on the Global Traffic in Human Organs. In *Whitaker*: 563-568. (Reprinted from *The Lancet* 361:1645-48.)
28. SINGER, MERILL et al. 1992. Why Does Juan Garcia Have a Drinking Problem? The Perspective of Critical Medical Anthropology. *Medical Anthropology* 14(1):77-108. (Reprinted in *Understanding and Applying Medical Anthropology*. Peter Brown ed., 286-302. Mountain View, Calif.: Mayfield Pub. Co.)
29. TAYLOR, JANELLE S. 2008. On Recognition, Caring, and Dementia. *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 22(4): 313-335.
30. WHITEFORD, MICHAEL B. 2006 [1999]. Homeopathic Medicine in the City of Oaxaca, Mexico: Patients' Perspectives and Observations. In *Whitaker*: 53-59. (Reprinted from *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 13(1): 69-78)
31. 奥野 克己 2007 「シャーマニズム—シャーマンは風変わりな医者か？」『医療人類学のレッスン：病いをめぐる文化を探る』光穂池田・克己奥野(編), pp. 172-198. 東京: 学陽書房。▶LESSON #5
32. 嶋澤 恭子 2007 「リプロダクション—「生むこと」は単純ではないのか？」『医療人類学のレッスン：病いをめぐる文化を探る』光穂池田・克己奥野(編), pp. 148-171. 東京: 学陽書房。▶LESSON #7